

## Remedies chronology, Spring 2006. Monique Lillard.

### Introduction

- The role of remedies
- Classifying remedies
- Substitutionary and specific remedies
- Legal and equitable remedies
- The nature of remedies

### Compensatory Damages

**The basic principle: restoring plaintiff to his rightful position**

*United States v. Hatahley*

**Value as the measure of the rightful position**

*United States v. Fifty Acres of Land*

Value

*Trinity Church v. John Hancock Mutual Life Insurance Co.*

Value unique to the owner

*Decatur County Ag-Services v. Young*

Property that fluctuates in value

The value of time

Choosing between competing measures of damages

**Reliance and expectancy as measures of the rightful position**

*Neri v. Retail Marine Corp.*

UCC § 2-708(2) and attempts to codify remedies

Expectancy and reliance

Compensating expectancies

*Chatlos Systems, Inc. v. National Cash Register Corp.*

Excessive expectancies

*Smith v. Bolles*

The distinction between tort and contract

**Consequential damages**

*Buck v. Morrow*

General and special damages

The vocabulary of damages

*Meinrath v. Singer Co.*

Consequential damages from failure to pay money

*Texaco, Inc. v. Pennzoil Co.*

An Eleven-Figure Verdict

**Limits on the basic principle**

Avoidable consequences, offsetting benefits, and collateral sources

*S.J. Groves & Sons Co. v. Warner Co.*

Avoidable consequences

Offsetting Benefits

*Helpend v. Southern California Rapid Transit District*

The collateral source rule  
The scope of liability  
*Pruitt v. Allied Chemical Corp.*  
The economic harm rule  
*Evra Corp. v. Swiss Bank Corp.*  
The certainty requirement  
*Bigelow v. RKO Radio Pictures*

### **Damages where value cannot be measured in dollars**

Personal injuries and death  
*Debus v. Grand Union Stores*  
Pain and suffering  
Wrongful death  
Dignitary and constitutional harms  
*Levka v. City of Chicago*  
Dignitary torts  
Remittitur  
The right to recover for emotional distress  
*Carey v. Piphus*  
Valuing constitutional rights  
Defamation damages  
The impact of tort reform  
*Etheridge v. Medical Center Hospitals*  
*Smith v. Department of Insurance*  
The controversy over tort law  
Valuing pain and suffering and human life

### **Injunctive Relief**

#### **Preventive injunctions**

*Humble Oil & Refining Co. v. Harang*  
Ripeness, propensity, and the scope of preventive injunctions  
*Marshall v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co.*  
The scope of preventive injunctions  
Individual and class injunctions  
*United States v. W.T. Grant Co.*  
Mootness and propensity  
*Nicholson v. Connecticut Half-Way House, Inc.*  
Ripeness, uncertain consequences, and prophylactic injunctions  
Constitutional and remedial ripeness  
Coercive relief at law

#### **Reparative injunctions**

*Bell v. Southwell*  
*Forster v. Boss*  
Laycock: *Injunctions and the Irreparable Injury Rule*  
*Winston Research Corp. v. Minnesota Mining & Manufacturing Co.*  
Reparative injunctions and the rightful position

*Bailey v. Proctor*  
Equitable discretion  
Prophylactic injunctions

### **Structural injunctions**

*Hutto v. Finney*  
Institutional reform  
*Lewis v. Casey*  
Recommitment to the rightful position?  
The *Microsoft* remedy

## **Choosing Remedies**

### **Substitutionary or specific relief**

Irreplaceable losses

*Pardee v. Camden Lumber Co.*

Maitland: *Equity*

Equity in the United States

The reasons for the irreparable injury rule

*Brook v. James A. Cullimore & Co.*

Replevin and injunctions

*Continental Airlines, Inc. v. Intra Brokers, Inc.*

The content of the irreparable injury rule

Laycock: *The Death of the Irreparable Injury Rule*

*Campbell Soup Co. v. Wentz*

Specific performance of contracts

Efficient breach of contract

Specific performance when cover is possible

*Van Wagner Advertising Corp. v. S & M Enterprises*

Irreparable injury and undue hardship

Burdens on defendant or the court

*Ariola v. Nigro*

Undue hardship

The economics of undue hardship

Undue hardship when plaintiff seeks money

Reasons of substantive or procedural policy

*Willing v. Mazzocone*

*Mazzocone v. Willing*

Insolvent defendants

Prior restraints

The right to jury trial

Avoiding a “multiplicity of suits”

Preliminary or permanent relief

*Los Angeles Memorial Coliseum Commission v. National Football League*

Preliminary relief

*Lakeshore Hills, Inc. v. Adcox*

Preserving the status quo

*Coyne-Delany Co. v. Capital Development Board*  
Injunction bonds  
Temporary restraining orders  
*Carroll v. President of Princess Anne*  
Preliminary procedure  
Irreparable injury, again

## **Contempt**

Three kinds of contempt  
*International Union, United Mine Workers v. Bagwell*  
Coercive contempt  
*Anyanwu v. Anyanwu*  
Perpetual coercion  
*Griffin v. County School Board*  
Contempt of anticipated injunctions  
Contempt statutes  
The collateral bar rule  
*Walker v. City of Birmingham*  
The duty to obey erroneous injunctions  
Drafting decrees  
The requirement that injunctions be specific  
The rule against incorporating other documents  
Drafting your own injunction

## **Restitution**

### **Disgorging profits**

The basic principle  
*Olwell v. Nye & Nissen Co.*  
Recovering more than plaintiff lost  
Quasi-contract  
*Maier Brewing Co. v. Fleishmann Distilling Corp.*  
*Snepp v. United States*  
Constructive trusts and accounting for profits  
Irreparable injury  
Restitution of money not spend on safety  
Disgorging the profits from breach of contract  
Measuring the profits  
*Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp.*  
Apportioning profits  
*Hamil America, Inc. v. GFI*  
Calculating profits

### **Restitution and contract**

*Mutual Benefit Life Insurance Co. v. JMR Electronics Corp.*  
Rescission  
*Farash v. Sykes Datatronics, Inc.*

The benefit requirement  
Election of remedies

## **Punitive Remedies**

### **Common law and statutes**

*Grimshaw v. Ford Motor Co.*

The standard for awarding punitive damages

Measuring punitive damages

### **Other punitive remedies**

Statutory recoveries by private litigants

Civil penalties payable to the government

### **The constitution**

*BMW, Inc. v. Gore*

The constitutionality of punitive damages

*State Farm v. Campbell*

## **Litigation Expenses**

*City of Riverside v. Rivera*

The American rule

Exceptions to the American rule

One-way fee shifting

The amount of the judgment as a constraint on attorney's fees

The prevailing party requirement

Calculating the lodestar

*In re Synthroid Marketing Litigation*

The common fund rule

Contingency enhancements

Competing approaches to calculating fee awards

Costs

*Evans v. Jeff D.*

Ethical problems in fee awards

Luban: *Taking Out the Adversary: The Assault on Progressive Public-Interest Lawyers*

## **Replevin, Ejectment, and the Like**

*Welch v. Kosasky*

Replevin and monetary recoveries

Ejectment and forcible detainer

Constitutional restrictions on summary actions for possession of property